



MINUTES

Fisheries Local Action Group Meeting – 9.00am Friday 15 June 2018

Held at:	Arden House Hotel, Kirkcudbright		
Attendees:	Alastair McNeill (AM) Chair	Debbie Parke (DP)	
	Caroline Graham Brown (CG)	Pam Taylor (PT)	
	June Lochhead (JL)	Jonathan Warren (JW)	
	Sean McGuire (SM)		
Staff	Nicola Hill (NH)	Jessie Mason (JM)	
	Rowan Lloyd (RL)		
Apologies:	Grant Course (GC)	Harry Harbottle (HH)	

Meeting commenced at 9.02am

1 Welcome

AM opened the meeting and welcomed all members. He thanked all members for allowing the early start of the meeting to cover business and ensure the meeting remained quorate.

Apologies

Were received from GC and HH.

Declarations of Interest

JL and AM declared an interest in the Solway Firth Partnership Project, Fishing Faces as they were Board Members and Chair.

PT declared an interest in the Stranraer Development Trust Application, Stranraer Oyster Festival's Local Seafood Celebration.

2 Minutes of Meeting of 16 March 2018

Minutes of the previous meeting had amendments made as per comments from SM, they were then accepted as a true and accurate record of the previous meeting on 16 March and proposed by SM and seconded by DP.

3 FLAG Project Officer update

RL provided an update on:

- Progress with projects approved at the March FLAG meeting:
 - o Borgue lobsters have now purchased half of their storage unit and made their first claim.
 - o Portpatrick harbour resurfacing project has been serviced by another, more appropriate, EMFF Fund.
- Position with EOIs: The FLAG have now received 40 EOI's, requesting £2,391,284.00, since the program was launched.
- The current financial overview of the FLAG fund
 - o Current FLAG Budget - £381,371.26
 - o Applications coming to the June Meeting - £120,903.00
 - o Applications coming to the September meeting - £343,500.00
 - o New EOI's entering the system - £295,353.00

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





Other areas are behind Dumfries and Galloway. We look like we will have our fund committed by the end of the year. JW wondered if there would be opportunities to vire money from other areas. NH suggested this would be unlikely as we are running out of time. Feedback is that each area should proceed with committing the funds they have.

SM highlighted that we will remain within the Common Fisheries Policy for at least another 2 years as part of the recently announced transition deal, and queried whether further FLAG funding was going to be made available.

4 Consideration of Full Applications

NH Chaird this application due to the declaration of interest by AM and JL. RL gave a synopsis of the project to the meeting.

4.1 Solway Firth Partnership, Fishing Faces - £16,811 (100%)

Discussion took place as follows:

The group were further advised there were to be 80,000 copies of the publication printed and distributed to 54 locations.

RL noted that if the FLAG wish to recommend this project to Marine Scotland for sponsorship then the applicant will need to include the actual costs included on the tender document for the delivery of the photography aspect of the project. RL reassured the FLAG that provision of such information would not impact on the total cost of the project, and all tenders bid roughly the same amount.

PT advised the meeting about the cost of the arts based commission, rather than asking for quotes, it is understood that you provide a cost to those you wish to tender and they then draw up a brief of what they can provide for the cost, hence the same "price" provided for the quotations. Kim Ayres is an artist with a proven track record in this area with a unique and distinct style, it is likely that the images could be widely used afterwards.

CG noted that she felt SFP could improve on their delivery and distribution of the publications as there always seemed to be a large number not circulated. PT explained that this might be due to difficulties previously experienced with getting re-prints, so it looked like there were stockpiles.

JW highlighted that the project benefits the wider fishing community, and has a good geographical spread across the region.

After the discussion the group scored the application:

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





				TOTAL SCORE	32/33	
0 = Insufficient evidence provided	1 = Some evidence provided	2 = Good level of evidence provided	3 = Fully demonstrated by evidence provided			
Strategic Fit:						
1. To the EMFF Union Priority 4 (<i>appendix 1</i>)			0	1	2	3
2. To the EMFF Community-Led Local Development objectives (<i>appendix 2</i>)			0	1	2	3
3. To at least one of the LDS Themes (<i>appendix 3</i>)			0	1	2	3
4. To the LDS priorities for inshore fisheries (<i>appendix 3</i>)			0	1	2	3
Eligibility:						
5. Does this project conform to the EMFF funding criteria, i.e. has required documentation been submitted?			0	1	2	3
6. Has the applicant demonstrated that this project could not run without EMFF support?			0	1	2	3
7. Is the projects contribution to the objectives of the EMFF and the LDS proportionate to the funding being requested?			0	1	2	3
8. Member States may apply an intensity of public aid between 50% and 100% of the total eligible expenditure where the FLAG conclude the project fulfils all of the following criteria: (i) It is of collective interest (ii) It has a collective beneficiary (iii) It has innovative features, where appropriate, at local level			Yes (if so, why?)		No	
Competency:						
9. Are the project plans viable (considering the costs, timeframes and delivery mechanisms)?			0	1	2	3
10. Is the project likely to deliver an impact/benefit beyond the funding period?			0	1	2	3

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





11 Does the project applicant demonstrate adequate knowledge, experience and enthusiasm to deliver?		1	2	3
12 Does the project adequately identified and address anticipated project barriers or risks?	0	1	2	3
Recommendation for funding:	APPROVE 5	REJECT 0	DEFER 0	
Chair Signature: Nicola Hill	Council Signature: David Gardiner			

Application group score: 32/33
 Number of Members APPROVING: 5
 Number of Members NOT APPROVING: 0

The decision was taken to **APPROVE** this project. The FLAG unanimously agreed that this was an innovative project that did not directly benefit one individual but would have a wider benefit to the larger fishing industry, and therefore should be considered eligible for 100% funding.

9.32am AM and JL returned to the discussions in the meeting

4.2 Galloway Fisheries Trust, Galloway Rivers Salmon Habitat Enhancement Officer. Total project cost: £65,814.14, FLAG intervention rate: 100%,

Discussion took place as follows:

It was noted that the post would not go ahead without funding.

RL highlighted that the applicant had taken measures on page 11 of the business case to justify that this project was not a general running cost for the organisation, and would generate new approach to habitat management for the organisation.

CG queried the sustainability of funding an organisation whose business model was partly reliant upon grant funding for its existence. PT noted that this was a grey area, and reminded the FLAG that they have already supported several organisations which are reliant on grant funding for their existence.

DP noted her concern that the project application did not clearly define the anticipated outcomes of the project. The rest of the FLAG agreed with this point.

CG reminded members that the applicant had previously succeeded in accessing funding for the "Saving the Sparling" and the "Atlantic Salmon" projects and queried why this project proposal was coming after these projects and not before.

RL asked the group if they thought this project represented value for money with regards to benefiting the local commercial fishing industry in comparison to other applications to the FLAG. DP noted it is unlikely the rivers of D&G

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





will be open for commercial fishing in the near future. JW noted that this project would benefit local angling clubs and volunteers.

CG noted that they are asking for 100% funding and queried why match funding from other companies had not been sought.

RL reminded the FLAG that although we have a large quantity of projects in the system there is no guarantee these pipeline projects will come to the table. AM advised the meeting that the Group should consider each application as if this was the first.

JL noted that involving schools is good news, and nice to see an emphasis on education.

After discussion, scoring took place as follows:

DRAFT

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





				TOTAL SCORE	21/33	
0 = Insufficient evidence provided	1 = Some evidence provided	2 = Good level of evidence provided	3 = Fully demonstrated by evidence provided			
Strategic Fit:						
1	To the EMFF Union Priority 4 (<i>appendix 1</i>)	0	1	2	3	
2	To the EMFF Community-Led Local Development objectives (<i>appendix 2</i>)	0	1	2	3	
3	To at least one of the LDS Themes (<i>appendix 3</i>)	0	1	2	3	
4	To the LDS priorities for inshore fisheries (<i>appendix 3</i>)	0	1	2	3	
Eligibility:						
5	Does this project conform to the EMFF funding criteria, i.e. has required documentation been submitted?	0	1	2	3	
6	Has the applicant demonstrated that this project could not run without EMFF support?	0	1	2	3	
7	Is the projects contribution to the objectives of the EMFF and the LDS proportionate to the funding being requested?	0	1	2	3	
8	Member States may apply an intensity of public aid between 50% and 100% of the total eligible expenditure where the FLAG conclude the project fulfils all of the following criteria: (iv) It is of collective interest (v) It has a collective beneficiary (vi) It has innovative features, where appropriate, at local level	Yes (if so, why?)		No		
Competency:						
9	Are the project plans viable (considering the costs, timeframes and delivery mechanisms)?	0	1	2	3	
10	Is the project likely to deliver an impact/benefit beyond the funding period?	0	1	2	3	

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





11 Does the project applicant demonstrate adequate knowledge, experience and enthusiasm to deliver?	0	1	2	3
12 Does the project adequately identified and address anticipated project barriers or risks?	0	1	2	3
Recommendation for funding:	APPROVE 5	REJECT 0	DEFER 6	
Chair Signature: Alastair McNeill	Council Signature: David Gardiner			

Application group score: 21/33

Number of Members APPROVING: 0

Number of Members NOT APPROVING: 6

The decision was taken to **DEFER** this project. The reasons for this decision are as follows:

- Insufficient evidence regarding the proposed outcomes of this project provided
- Insufficient explanation as to how this project is innovative, and thus eligible for 100% funding.

4.3 Harry Hedley, Shrimp Wholesaler application, total eligible expenditure of £15,782.00, requesting a grant of £7,891.00.

Discussion took place as follows:

The existence of a market for Shrimp was queried. RL referenced the letters of support provided by the applicant from processors expressing their willingness to purchase these produce. CG noted that previously there had been a couple of boats fished for shrimp out of Annan that and done quite well.

SM noted that the boats who had provided letters of support do not currently fish for shrimp. RL noted that this does not necessarily equate to an increase in fishing activity if they were to catch shrimp as they would be diversifying into shrimp and subsequently reducing effort on other species.

AM noted that there is no quota for shrimp. SM noted that shrimp is not considered a pressure stock.

DP noted her support from a project that reduced wastage by 25%.

All FLAG members concluded that this equipment could/may be used to store more than just shrimps. RL noted that the applicant intends to store whelks, however he currently has no intentions to establish himself as a whelk wholesaler. CG concluded that this was a capacity building project.

The local Hotel said they will support if prawns landed, they would buy from him.

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





Supporting communities across
Dumfries and Galloway



After discussion, JL and SM advised the meeting that they wished to abstain from scoring. NH advised them that the application would not be able to be scored if that was the case as the group would not be quorate. JL said she would take part in the voting if that was the case.

After discussion, the group scored as follows

DRAFT

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





				TOTAL SCORE	33/33	
0 = Insufficient evidence provided	1 = Some evidence provided	2 = Good level of evidence provided	3 = Fully demonstrated by evidence provided			
Strategic Fit:						
1. To the EMFF Union Priority 4 (<i>appendix 1</i>)				0	1	2 3
2. To the EMFF Community-Led Local Development objectives (<i>appendix 2</i>)				0	1	2 3
3. To at least one of the LDS Themes (<i>appendix 3</i>)				0	1	2 3
4. To the LDS priorities for inshore fisheries (<i>appendix 3</i>)				0	1	2 3
Eligibility:						
5. Does this project conform to the EMFF funding criteria, i.e. has required documentation been submitted?				0	1	2 3
6. Has the applicant demonstrated that this project could not run without EMFF support?				0	1	2 3
7. Is the projects contribution to the objectives of the EMFF and the LDS proportionate to the funding being requested?				0	1	2 3
Competency:						
8. Are the project plans viable (considering the costs, timeframes and delivery mechanisms)?				0	1	2 3
9. Is the project likely to deliver an impact/benefit beyond the funding period?				0	1	2 3
10. Does the project applicant demonstrate adequate knowledge, experience and enthusiasm to deliver?				0	1	2 3
11. Does the project adequately identified and address anticipated project barriers or risks?				0	1	2 3

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





Recommendation for funding:	APPROVE 5	REJECT 0	DEFER 0
Chair Signature: Alastair McNeill	Council Signature: David Gardiner		

Application group score: 33/33
Number of Members APPROVING: 5
Number of Members NOT APPROVING: 0

The decision was taken to **APPROVE** this project. One member of the Group (SM) abstained from scoring.

PT left the meeting at 11.10am as she had previously declared an interest in the project

4.4 Stranraer Development Trust application for the Stranraer Oyster Festival's Local Seafood Celebration total eligible expenditure of £30,386.45, grant of 100% requested.

Discussion took place as follows:

RL noted that the applicant would need to obtain a cost breakdown from alternative suppliers prior to this application being submitted to Marine Scotland for sponsorship.

SM noted that the Clyde Fishermen Association have changed the date of their festival to ensure it does not clash with the Oyster festival this year.

JW noted that the Stranraer Development Trust has acknowledged the criticisms outlined in the post project review of last year's event, and taken measures to address them with this project proposal.

The FLAG concluded that last year's event was a great success and this element of the festival was sufficiently different from what was proposed last year.

After discussion, the group scored as follows:

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





				TOTAL SCORE	32/33	
0 = Insufficient evidence provided	1 = Some evidence provided	2 = Good level of evidence provided	3 = Fully demonstrated by evidence provided			
Strategic Fit:						
1	To the EMFF Union Priority 4 (<i>appendix 1</i>)	0	1	2	3	
2	To the EMFF Community-Led Local Development objectives (<i>appendix 2</i>)	0	1	2	3	
3	To at least one of the LDS Themes (<i>appendix 3</i>)	0	1	2	3	
4	To the LDS priorities for inshore fisheries (<i>appendix 3</i>)	0	1	2	3	
Eligibility:						
5	Does this project conform to the EMFF funding criteria, i.e. has required documentation been submitted?	0	1	2	3	
6	Has the applicant demonstrated that this project could not run without EMFF support?	0	1	2	3	
7	Is the projects contribution to the objectives of the EMFF and the LDS proportionate to the funding being requested?	0	1	2	3	
8	Member States may apply an intensity of public aid between 50% and 100% of the total eligible expenditure where the FLAG conclude the project fulfils all of the following criteria: I. It is of collective interest II. It has a collective beneficiary III. It has innovative features, where appropriate, at local level	Yes (if so, why?)		No		
Competency:						
9	Are the project plans viable (considering the costs, timeframes and delivery mechanisms)?	0	1	2	3	
10	Is the project likely to deliver an impact/benefit beyond the funding period?	0	1	2	3	

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





11 Does the project applicant demonstrate adequate knowledge, experience and enthusiasm to deliver?		1	2	3
12 Does the project adequately identified and address anticipated project barriers or risks?	0	1	2	3
Recommendation for funding:	APPROVE 5	REJECT 0	DEFER 0	
Chair Signature: Nicola Hill	Council Signature: David Gardiner			

Application group score: 32/33
Number of Members APPROVING: 5
Number of Members NOT APPROVING: 0

The decision was taken to **APPROVE** this project.

The FLAG unanimously agreed that this project would benefit the wider fishing industry and therefore eligible for 100% funding. The FLAG also noted that this project was suitably different from last year's EMFF application and therefore can be considered as innovative in its approach to increasing the presence of local seafood within the region.

5 EOI's received

5.1: Dumfries and Galloway College, Revised Marine Development Officer post:

SM noted that there are several National Colleges in the country which already offer a variety of Marine Training qualifications. SM also noted that Seafish, a National Agency, already provide certified mandatory training in South West Scotland at a heavily subsidised price.

JL noted that Seafish previously went into schools to recruit young people into the industry. SM noted that this programme was very successful but funding has subsequently been pulled.

The FLAG concluded that the applicants should be advised to contact Seafish before progressing with developing a full application.

The FLAG requested a full application be developed for consideration in September.

5.2: R McMillan Welding, Expansion to Existing Business:

PT queried as to whether the apprentices would be employed through a government scheme. The FLAG unanimously agreed that the applicant should consider contacting Dumfries and Galloway Council's Skills and Employability team to see what support is available.

CG noted that the cost breakdown did not highlight any costs associated with employing an apprentice. The Group unanimously agreed that the final application must include a commitment to employing an apprentice.

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





RL also noted that Business Gateway may be able to provide support with the development of the business case aspect of this application.

The FLAG requested a full application be developed for consideration in September.

5.3: Palnackie Port Group, Palnackie Community Public Access Point

RL advised that access to the potential pontoon/steps is owned by Scottish Water, and the group are currently awaiting a letter of support/permission of access from Scottish water.

AM noted that the applicants must be advised to contact Marine Scotland as this project involves works below the high tide mark and subsequently the project may fall under the 1985 Food and Environmental Protection Act.

SM noted that the group may require permission from the Crown Estate to carry out works on the river bank and a licence from Marine Scotland. The FLAG unanimously agreed that the applicant should be encouraged to contact both the Crown Estate and Marine Scotland.

The FLAG requested a full application be developed for consideration in September.

5.4: AMP Seafoods, Portpatrick AMP Seafoods Sustainable Fishing

SM noted that fishing activity would take places in area 7a of which there is very little quota available for catching finned fish. The FLAG unanimously agreed that the applicant should provide evidence that they possess a quota for finned fish.

PT queried as to whether the claim of sustainably caught fish would be based on any form of certification. RL noted that if the applicant wish to refer to their product as sustainable then they would require some form of third party certification.

The group queried the business case of purchasing a van and requested a full business case be provided as part of the application.

JL and SM both raised concern that the purchase of new creels was an upgrade which should be considered a general operating cost for all creel fishermen, for this reason they consider this aspect of the application ineligible.

The FLAG requested a full application be developed for consideration in September.

5.5: Barony Country Foods Ltd, Upgrade of Lochengower Website and Online Shop

DP raised concern that the applicant claimed to sell wild caught Solway salmon and Bass. DP noted Wild Salmon and Bass from the Solway may only be by haaf net on the Nith, within the Category 1 area, and on the Annan, by scientific dispensation. These are the only cases in which this stock can legally be sold.

JW noted that excluding the issue of the sale of illegal fish, this application was generally something the FLAG would be willing to sponsor.

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





The FLAG requested a full application be developed for consideration in September if the applicant can provide credible evidence that they are not currently selling illegal produce in their store.

5.6: Terry Shields, Commercial shellfish diving apprentice project

JL raised concerns that the razor clam fishing trial Mr Shields is involved in is currently closed due to issue of Environmental Health.

The FLAG concluded that the employment of an intern is something they are keen to support and if the issue of Environmental Health is resolved then they would like to see this project come forward as a full application for consideration in September.

5.7: Portpatrick Harbour Community Benefit Society, Portpatrick Harbour quayside buildings renovation

SM queried whether this was a listed building and whether planning permission would need to be sought prior to this project progressing.

PT queried whether it would be possible for the applicant to deliver this project within the budget forecast and requested confirmation be sought on this matter.

The FLAG concluded that they would wish to see this project come forward as a full application.

5.8: Robert Callander, Fisherman's Shack

Members queried the location of this project and RL explained it was on the Quay close to New Abbey.

AM raised concerns regarding access to the quay.

DP raised concerns regarding current ban on net fishing of salmon in the region.

SM queried whether this project would be considered an increase in fishing effort by Marine Scotland's audit team.

The FLAG concluded that the benefit to the community commercial fishing industry did not represent value for money in comparison to other projects on the table and therefore requested that this applicant be discouraged from progressing with their application.

6. AOCB

The Angling Boat owned by Derek Farr, a previously supported project under FLAG has ceased trading. Will highlight to Marine Scotland for them to look into whether it has fulfilled the objective of funding ie to trade for no less than 5 years.

GDPR – members had it clarified that they are still able to discuss applications with members/associations they represent but they cannot share by email.

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk





7. Cockle subgroup update

RL provided a verbal update on the cockle re-layering project.

Meeting closed at 12.25pm.

Date and time of next meeting 10.00am on 14 September 2018, Arden House Hotel, Kirkcudbright.

DRAFT

Dumfries and Galloway LEADER Programme, Kirkbank House, English Street, Dumfries, DG1 2HS, Scotland

Tel: 01387 260028 Web: www.dgleader.co.uk

